

Dynamics in the Upper Solar Convection Zone

by

Marc Lyle DeRosa

B.A., Johns Hopkins University, 1994

M.S., University of Colorado, 1997

A thesis submitted to the
Faculty of the Graduate School of the
University of Colorado in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Astrophysical and Planetary Sciences

2001

This thesis entitled:
Dynamics in the Upper Solar Convection Zone
written by Marc Lyle DeRosa
has been approved for the Department of Astrophysical and Planetary Sciences

Juri Toomre

Nicholas H. Brummell

Peter A. Gilman

Jeffrey B. Weiss

Ellen G. Zweibel

Date _____

The final copy of this thesis has been examined by the signatories, and we find that both the content and the form meet acceptable presentation standards of scholarly work in the above mentioned discipline.

DeRosa, Marc Lyle (Ph.D., Astrophysical and Planetary Sciences)

Dynamics in the Upper Solar Convection Zone

Thesis directed by Professor Juri Toomre

The differential rotation of the sun, as deduced from helioseismology, exhibits a prominent layer of radial shear near the top of the convection zone. This shearing boundary layer just below the solar surface is composed of convection possessing a broad range of length and time scales, including granulation, mesogranulation, and supergranulation. Such turbulent convection is likely to influence the dynamics of the deep convection zone in ways that are not yet fully understood. We seek to assess the effects of this near-surface shear layer through two complementary studies, one observational and the other theoretical in nature. Both deal with turbulent convection occurring on supergranular scales within the upper solar convection zone.

We characterize the horizontal outflow patterns associated with solar supergranulation by individually identifying several thousand supergranules from a 45° -square field of quiet sun. This region is tracked for a duration of six days as it rotates across the disk of the sun, using full-disk ($2''$ pixels) SOI-MDI images from the SOHO spacecraft of line-of-sight Doppler velocity imaging the solar photosphere at a cadence of one minute. This time series represents the first study of solar supergranulation at such high combined temporal and spatial resolution over an extended period of time. The outflow cells in this region are observed to have a distribution of sizes, ranging from 14–20 Mm across, while continuously evolving on time scales of several days. Such evolution manifests itself in the form of cell merging, fragmentation, and advection, as the supergranules and their associated network of convergence lanes respond to the turbulent convection occurring a short distance below the photosphere.

We have also conducted three-dimensional numerical simulations of turbulent

compressible convection within thin spherical shells located near the top of the convection zone. Vigorous fluid motions possessing several length and time scales are driven by imposing the solar heat flux and differential rotation at the bottom of the domain. The convection patterns form a connected network of downflow lanes in the surface layers that break up into more plume-like structures with depth. The regions delineated by this downflow network enclose broad upflows that fragment into smaller structures near the surface. We find that a negative radial gradient of angular velocity Ω is maintained against diffusion in these simulations by the tendency for the convective motions to partially conserve their angular momentum in radial motion. This behavior suggests that similar dynamics may be responsible for the decrease of Ω with radius as deduced from helioseismology within the upper shear layer of the solar convection zone.

Dedication

To my parents, Pete and Cindy, and to my sister Lisa.

Acknowledgements

The research presented in this thesis simply would not have been completed without the guidance, encouragement, and wisdom of my advisor and mentor, Juri Toomre. Starting with the first summer following my arrival in Boulder, and extending throughout the intervening years up to the present time, Juri has stimulated my interest in the rich fields of solar physics and astrophysical fluid dynamics while providing perspective, insight, and sage advice at several critical junctures along the way. His cheerful nature, sparkling wit, and unending generosity have made this experience a truly enjoyable one.

I would like to acknowledge several members of the solar group here at CU, including Deborah Haber, Sacha Brun, Nic Brummell, Brad Hindman, and Jason Lisle, who have shaped my understanding of the solar interior through several helpful discussions. I am indebted in particular to Mark Miesch, Tom Clune, and Julian Elliott for their long, arduous hours spent programming and debugging the ASH computer code. Special mention also goes to Kelly Cline, who endured varied mood swings and other eccentric behavior as my officemate for the last three years, as well as to Anne Hammond and Gwen Dickinson for their attention to detail and the behind-the-scenes work necessary to keep things running smoothly.

It is also necessary to mention several folks residing at outside institutions for their part in this research. Analysis of the numerical simulations presented in Chapter 5 progressed largely due to several long sessions with Peter Gilman of HAO, whose broad experience with fluid flows of all flavors within spherical shells was (and continues to

be) a huge asset. Additionally, Dick Shine of Lockheed-Martin graciously provided his ideas and experience (and perhaps most importantly, his computer code) associated with correlation tracking methods. Tom Duvall, Rick Bogart, and John Beck of the SOI-MDI Team at Stanford assisted in part in the processing and subsequent analysis of the large MDI dataset of the near-surface solar velocity field. Without their contributions, the research of Chapter 3 would never have advanced to its current state. Support for this research was provided by NSF grants ATM-9731676, ECS-9217394, and GRT-9355046, and NASA grants NAG 5-8133 and NAG 5-7996.

Memories of my time in Boulder will always be associated with the many friends with whom I have spent countless hours playing softball and volleyball, watching movies, playing poker, rooting for the Broncos, Rockies, and Avs, hiking, and eating steak. A few deserve special mention. Marc Swisdak, whom I met within a week of arriving in Boulder, is an associate and close friend anyone would be lucky to have, and I will always be grateful for his kindness, gracefulness, and his amazing ability to remember almost anything. I would also like to recognize my housemates Eli Michael and Jason Tumlinson for making it through the last several months without getting too annoyed living with someone who was probably a little too stressed out. Many thanks go out to Amanda Sickafoose, who has shown me the merits of having a take-charge attitude in life, and to Matt Beasley, for always being so effervescently happy and for showing me how to effectively dispose of disposable income.

Finally, I am truly grateful for having such a wonderful family. My sister, Lisa, must be commended for having grown up with an older brother who was probably somewhat overbearing at times, and for managing nevertheless to turn into a top-notch person who will undoubtedly be extremely successful at any endeavor she tries. Lastly, I am truly indebted to my parents, Pete and Cindy, who have provided a positive environment filled with direction, encouragement, motivation, and love in which a rather shy kid could develop the confidence and determination to realize his dreams.

Contents

Chapter

1	INTRODUCTION: THE DYNAMIC SOLAR CONVECTION ZONE	1
1.1	OBSERVATIONS OF THE SOLAR SURFACE	2
1.1.1	Differential Rotation of the Surface and Interior	2
1.1.2	Dynamics in the Near-Surface Layers	4
1.2	SIMULATIONS OF TURBULENT CONVECTION	7
1.2.1	Mean-Field Hydrodynamic Models of the Convection Zone	7
1.2.2	Multi-Mode Hydrodynamical Simulations	8
1.2.3	Models Including Magnetic Effects	13
1.3	SUMMARY OF RESEARCH PRESENTED IN THIS THESIS	16
2	SURFACE FLOW MEASUREMENTS	19
2.1	AN OVERVIEW OF SURFACE FLOWS	19
2.1.1	Direct Doppler Methods	19
2.1.2	Local Helioseismic Techniques	22
2.1.3	Tracer-Type Measurements	23
2.2	OBTAINING SURFACE FLOW FIELDS FROM MDI DATA	24
2.2.1	The MDI Instrument on SOHO	25
2.2.2	Isolating the Mesogranules	26
2.3	THE CORRELATION TRACKING TECHNIQUE	29

2.3.1	The Correlation Tracking Algorithm	29
2.3.2	Calibrating the Algorithm	31
3	THE NATURE OF SOLAR SUPERGRANULATION	38
3.1	ASSESSING CORRELATION TRACKED FLOW MAPS	38
3.1.1	Properties of the Flow Maps	38
3.1.2	Comparison With Direct Doppler Images	44
3.1.3	Comparison With Time-Distance Results	46
3.1.4	The Anomalous Flow Directed Toward Disk Center	49
3.2	A DYNAMICAL PICTURE OF SUPERGRANULATION	52
3.3	MEASURING SUPERGRANULAR SIZES AND LIFETIMES	60
3.3.1	Correlation Sizes and Lifetimes	60
3.3.2	The Direct Identification Method	62
3.4	FLOWS ON LARGER SCALES	73
3.5	CONCLUSIONS	79
4	NUMERICAL MODELING OF SPHERICAL SHELLS OF CONVECTION	81
4.1	NUMERICAL MODELING OF ANELASTIC FLUIDS	81
4.2	THE ASH CODE: EQUATION SUMMARY	84
4.2.1	Fluid Flow in a Rotating Frame	84
4.2.2	The Anelastic Approximation	88
4.2.3	Scaling of the Fully Compressible Fluid Equations	91
4.2.4	Energetics of the Anelastic Equations	94
4.2.5	Streamfunction Formalism	95
4.3	THE ASH CODE: NUMERICAL IMPLEMENTATION	96
4.3.1	Angular Discretization	96
4.3.2	Radial Discretization	98
4.3.3	Temporal Discretization and Parallel Implementation	99

5	SUPERGRANULAR CONVECTION IN THIN SHELL MODELS	103
5.1	INTRODUCTION	103
5.2	SUMMARY OF SIMULATION PARAMETERS	108
5.2.1	Initialization of the Spherically Symmetric Mean State	108
5.2.2	Approach to Thermal Equilibrium	112
5.3	GENERAL FLOW CHARACTERISTICS	114
5.3.1	Multi-Scale Convection	114
5.3.2	Time-Averaged Axisymmetric Flows	123
5.4	ENERGETICS OF AXISYMMETRIC FLOWS	127
5.4.1	Axisymmetric Differential Rotation Balance	127
5.4.2	The Radial Shear Layer Within Case <i>S1</i>	129
5.4.3	Differential Rotation Within Cases <i>S2</i> , <i>S3</i> , and <i>D2</i>	133
5.4.4	Axisymmetric Meridional Circulation	137
5.5	CONCLUSION	141
6	CONCLUDING REMARKS	143
6.1	SUMMARY OF RESEARCH PRESENTED IN THIS THESIS	143
6.2	FUTURE OUTLOOK	146
	Bibliography	150
	Appendix	
A	CORRELATION TRACKING ALGORITHM DETAILS	155
A.1	SETTING UP THE GRIDPOINT ARRAY	155
A.2	THE MERIT FUNCTION	156
A.3	MINIMIZING THE MERIT FUNCTION	160
A.4	ITERATING WITH BICUBIC SHIFTS	162

A.5	CORRELATION TRACKING PITFALLS	163
B	ASH CODE EQUATIONS — DETAILED DERIVATIONS	165
B.1	ANELASTIC FLUID EQUATIONS	165
B.1.1	Order in ϵ of All Dependent Variables	165
B.1.2	Derivation of the Anelastic Mass Continuity Equation	167
B.1.3	Derivation of the Anelastic Momentum Equations	168
B.1.4	Derivation of the Anelastic Energy Equation	168
B.1.5	Derivation of the Anelastic Equations of State	169
B.2	ANELASTIC EQUATION ENERGETICS	170
B.2.1	Derivation of the Kinetic Energy Conservation Equation	170
B.2.2	Derivation of the Internal Energy Conservation Equation	172
B.2.3	Derivation of the Total Energy Conservation Equation	173
B.3	THE NUMERICAL EVOLUTION EQUATIONS	174
B.3.1	Streamfunction Formalism	174
B.3.2	Streamfunction Identities	174
B.3.3	Components of the Divergence of the Viscous Stress Tensor	175
B.3.4	Derivation of the W Equation	190
B.3.5	Derivation of the P Equation	191
B.3.6	Derivation of the Z Equation	193
B.3.7	Derivation of the S Equation	195
C	ASH CODE TIME STEPPING	196
C.1	THE SECOND-ORDER CRANK-NICHOLSON METHOD	196
C.2	THE SECOND-ORDER ADAMS-BASHFORTH METHOD	198
C.3	COMBINING THE METHODS	199

Tables

Table

4.1	Definitions of symbols appearing in §4.2.	86
4.2	Estimates of v , ϵ , and M_a calculated from equations (4.14) and (4.20)	91
5.1	A summary of the parameters of the thin shell convection simulations	107
B.1	Order in ϵ for all quantities and operators appearing in the fully compressible fluid equations.	167
B.2	Strategy employed to obtain the ASH code evolution equations.	175

Figures

Figure

1.1	Rotation rates $\Omega/2\pi$ inferred from helioseismic analysis of SOI data . . .	4
1.2	Rotation rates $\Omega/2\pi$ inferred from helioseismic analysis of GONG data . . .	5
2.1	A full-disk velocity image	20
2.2	Data processing: remapping the full-disk images	27
2.3	Data processing: separating the mesogranules from the supergranules . . .	28
2.4	Sample images used for correlation tracking tests	33
2.5	Results of correlation tracking applied to Fig. 2.4a	34
2.6	Systematic and random errors for the two test images of Figure 2.4	35
3.1	Average flow map overplotted on velocity image	39
3.2	Average flow map overplotted on divergence image	40
3.3	Supergranules near disk center	42
3.4	Effects of time-averaging on low map velocity	43
3.5	Comparison between correlation tracking and direct Doppler velocity measurements	45
3.6	Visual comparison between divergence and travel-time approaches	47
3.7	Statistical comparison between divergence and travel-time maps	48
3.8	Anomalous large-scale flow	49
3.9	Corks subject to an evolving flow field	53

3.10	Corks subject to an evolving flow field	54
3.11	Corks subject to an evolving flow field	55
3.12	Formation of a convergence lane	56
3.13	Intermittent convergence lanes	57
3.14	Advection of convergence lanes	58
3.15	Space-time cut of horizontal divergence	59
3.16	Supergranular outflow cores	64
3.17	Corks overlaid on supergranular outflow cores	65
3.18	Corks overlaid on supergranular outflow cores	66
3.19	Evolution of outflow cores	67
3.20	Supergranule size histogram	68
3.21	Supergranule sizes vs. smoothing	69
3.22	Supergranule lifetime histogram	70
3.23	Supergranule lifetimes vs. smoothing	71
3.24	Histogram of supergranular sizes vs. lifetimes	72
3.25	Large-scale flows in quiet-sun	74
3.26	Longitudinally averaged zonal and meridional large-scale flows	75
3.27	Residual large-scale flow field	76
3.28	Comparison to ring-diagram results	77
3.29	Scatter diagram comparing correlation tracking and ring-diagram results	78
4.1	An illustration of the spherical shell domain	85
5.1	Average rotation rates $\Omega/2\pi$ inferred from helioseismology	104
5.2	Initial radial structure of the simulations	108
5.3	Approach to equilibrium for Case <i>D2</i>	112
5.4	Flux balance with Cases <i>S2</i> and <i>D2</i>	113
5.5	Horizontal planforms of radial velocity for Case <i>S2</i>	115

5.6	Horizontal planforms of radial velocity for Case <i>D2</i>	116
5.7	Vertical structure of radial velocity for Cases <i>S2</i> and <i>D2</i>	117
5.8	Horizontal advection of velocity structures of Case <i>S2</i>	118
5.9	Space-time velocity structures of Case <i>S2</i>	119
5.10	Histogram of radial velocities for Cases <i>S2</i> and <i>D2</i>	120
5.11	Horizontal temperature variation for Case <i>D2</i>	121
5.12	Latitudinal temperature variation for Case <i>D2</i>	122
5.13	Differential rotation profiles for all cases	124
5.14	Axisymmetric radial velocity profiles for all cases	125
5.15	Axisymmetric meridional velocity profiles for all cases	126
5.16	DRKE source terms for Case <i>S1</i>	129
5.17	Total DRKE and change for Case <i>S1</i>	130
5.18	Radial cuts in angular velocity for Cases <i>S1</i> , <i>S2</i> , and <i>S3</i>	131
5.19	Radial cuts in angular velocity for Case <i>D2</i>	134
5.20	DRKE source terms for Case <i>S2</i>	135
5.21	DRKE source terms for Case <i>D2</i>	136
5.22	DRKE source terms for Case <i>S3</i>	137
5.23	MCKE source terms for Case <i>S1</i>	139
5.24	MCKE source terms for Case <i>S2</i>	140